



# **Bruny Island Community Association Inc.**

**C/- Post Office Alonnah 7150**

**ABN 50847 581 523**

**Email: [bica@bica.org.au](mailto:bica@bica.org.au)**

## **General Meeting Minutes**

**Sunday 14<sup>th</sup> February, 2021 – CWA Hall, North Bruny**

**Committee:** Bill Hughes (President), Tania Mayne (Secretary), Dion Dillon (Public Officer), Robert Nixey (Treasurer), Tammy Price, Caz Newitt (Apology), John Lampkin, Lindon Haigh, Trevor Adams, Jodi Pickles (Apology), Adrian Howard (Apology) .

Mathew Fagan (online), Marie Pforr (online), Tessa & Terry, Les Adams, Linda Graham, Jenny & David Boyer, Karen & Wayne Darby, Sue Bastone

**Welcome:** Welcome everyone!

**Apologies:** Alan Mansell, Harry Price, Mark Brinkman, David and Rosemary Andrews, Jennifer & Keith Bill, Kathy Duncombe, Lyn Kumpulainen

**Volunteer for sausage cooking:** Thanks David!

**Previous Minutes: Moved:** Dion Dillon **Accepted:** Trevor Adams

### **Business Arising:**

- Leave shares in MyState will review in 6 months
- Authorising the transfer of funds from BICAL account to our general account
- Tammy moved all the accounts to xero – excellent job!
- Transfer all the money to CBA – term deposits on maturity
- Need to organise debit card from CBA to allow us to pay the ongoing costs out of BICA account rather than personal accounts (e.g netregistry, website etc) – Rob and Tania to organise
- Discussion about fuji xerox printing costs – looking into how we can cut costs of printing Bruny News with the help of local politicians and perhaps to buy a printer for the community to replace it.
- Form for uploading ads for the bruny news – Tania to look into
- Potable Water Supply  
David has meeting with Tas Water on Friday to discuss what to discuss at forum – if you have any topics that you wish to discuss please bring up with David before Friday.
- Keith – *Raised that there were three roads marked to be sealed that fell off the agenda, Harvey Road, Richie Street, Cemetery Road, Lockleys Road*  
Bill wrote to Mayor and received a reply – Harvey road will be considered for next financial year, Richie Street & Cemetery Road low priority, Lockleys Road is in the 5

year plan. Will undertake some traffic counting to check the priorities are correct. Barnes Bay Village and William Carte Road, and Lighthouse Road were also raised by the meeting as roads that need addressing - we will continue to push this with council.

- Need to send a letter State Government about sealing North Bruny roads. **ACTION** Bill to write a letter.
- *Richard raise the need for a jetty at Simpson Bay boat ramp.*  
Bill spoke to MAST – we have commenced the process to get a Jetty to put in there, they are on board with putting a Jetty there. Will push forward with that. Bill hasn't heard anything back from them – to follow up in the next few weeks.
- *Richard advised that Johnny Davis, a long time contributor to the Bruny community, has moved off the island – a story about Johnny to be included in Bruny News if he's ok with that idea*  
Bill to meet with Johnny next week to present him with his life membership
- *John Lampkin raised his concerns over the dead trees around the place, action needs to be taken urgently as the danger is extreme.*  
Trees were identified all over the island – Bill to take photos of them all so that he can include them in the letter when he sends it. Bill to progress in the next couple of weeks.
- Swift Parrot project – Bill contacted Marg Graham to get an update – not much to report, will have some things to report by the next meeting. Need to do some research on how the island can support protecting swift parrot habitat.
- Primary Industries Group met and have officially moved the Easter Carnival to BICA. Received \$8000 cheque (presented by Trevor) from Primary Industry Group to BICA for the carnival
- Tammy has Easter Carnival preparation well underway, permits and funding applications are underway – Tammy has killed it. Call for volunteers to help – contact Tammy
- *Organise a sign to put on the block that says 'Community Project being developed by Bruny Island Community Association'*  
Tammy organised! Needs to be put up. Bill. Still.
- Bruny News operation was discussed at length – need to review how it is printed, how copy is received and invoiced. Need to investigate Alison Standens/Nic Streets offer to print it for us. If that doesn't work we will look at other places to print, rather than fuji xerox.
- *Dion asked about the elderly care units and whether there was a proposal to extend them – long process – still ongoing. There is likely to be high demand for these and further ones to be built.*  
Bill is attending the Health meeting that tomorrow. Will follow up with Julie Collins.
- *Where are the bins? Sue to follow up*
- *Kingborough Consultative Community Forum – Meeting coming up 26<sup>th</sup> February – Tania and Rob to attend*

**Correspondence in:**

- David O'Byrne forwarded the response around the fire tower vegetation issue – conversations are ongoing.
- Provision of childcare options – email from Adventure Patch

**Correspondence out:**

- Letter to the Mayor about the roads

**Financial Report:**

- Transitioning from MyState to CBA is ongoing
- Rationalising the accounting moving from MYOB to Xero
- Profit and Loss and Balance Sheets attached.

**Other Reports:**

- Boat Club Report - Tammy  
The retaining wall issue with the erosion – ready to hit the go button once funding comes through. Bring the construction in line with the tender that just came out for the Alonnah footpath. Funding offers from various politicians are coming through. In negotiations with council about the leasing situation at the boat club.
- Community Library – Jess (via email)  
Have registered to attend the carnival with second hand book stall and holding a raffle to raise money.
- Bruny Island Cork Club - Trevor  
Meat raffle not possible at the moment due to covid restrictions – proposing to have 4 major raffles a year to continue to raise money.
- Mens Shed– Jeff Self  
Just received a defibrillator. A number of projects have been proposed at the shed.
- Bruny Island Reference Group - Lindon  
Next meeting on 3<sup>rd</sup> March at Alonnah Hall. Statement has been sent to the minister asking about the contractual obligation to have a booking system. Put the statement on the website (Tania) – statement also attached to minutes.

**General Business:**

- Rob has been doing some work rationalising insurance policies – he will be contacting local groups to try and get some costs savings for the Island community groups.
- Brinky sends his thanks for funding the pager system from north and south bruny fire brigades
- Cat Management Project – is ongoing – the cat shack is behind the pharmacy at Alonnah – if the flag is out, Kaylene Allan is there, go and check it out! She is there two days a week. Will officially be opened in March.  
Ring Conrad Daniels if you get a stray cat in your trap! He will deal with it.
- BICA support the boat club in their efforts to curtail erosion on the foreshore at the Boat Club. *Moved: Terry Seconded: Lindon Passed.*
- Megan and Barry – Lindon suggested given the extraordinary efforts of Megan & Barry in difficult circumstances that the current committee send on their thanks for

their efforts on the committee – Bill is in communication with Megan, to formalise our thanks in a letter.

- Some discussion to be had around finding an 'office' space to hold all of the BICA stuff to make it easier to handover in future. Rob is on the case!
- State Government are asking for consultation about where they should use in this years budget – Sealing of the road at North Bruny and the water supply at North Bruny are two that come to mind immediately. To be sent in my March. Bill and Tammy to discuss.

Next meeting Sunday the 14<sup>th</sup> March – Adventure Bay Hall.

Bruny Island residents, ratepayers, local businesses and community organisations.

## *Statement in relation to proposed Bruny Island Ferry booking system*

6 February 2021

### **Key Points**

#### ***A clear choice:***

- Bruny Islanders, State Government and the ferry operator (SeaLink) share the common aim of choosing the best ticketing and traffic management systems for all classes of ferry users.
- The current choice is between the existing 'queuing system' and a proposed 'booking system'.
- The 'queuing system' involves vehicles being ticketed and loaded in the order in which they arrive at the ferry terminal.
- The 'booking system' involves users booking and pre-paying (mainly online) to secure priority access to a scheduled transit or departure 'window'. Non-booked users would access stand-by places, when available.

#### ***A consensus view:***

- This document has been jointly prepared and unanimously agreed by the Bruny Island representatives on the Bruny Island Ferry Reference Group.
- It is supported by all undersigned Bruny Island community organisations and groups.

#### ***A considered position:***

- The document is presented in three parts: (1) background information on the past two and half years of deliberations; (2) a statement explaining the consensus position of Bruny Islanders and requesting a decision by Government; (3) details about the negative impacts of a booking system identified during community consultations and explored during Reference Group meetings.
- The position adopted by Bruny Islanders is based only on evidence, research and practical experience. It is not influenced by ideology, politics or any external factors. It takes into account the needs of all ferry users.

#### ***In summary:***

- Based on the evidence and information exhaustively considered by the Bruny Island Ferry Reference Group, the best overall system across all types of ferry users is the current queuing system.
- The queuing system is simple, low risk and highly efficient when coupled with sufficient ferry capacity. Recent improvements to traffic management, operational planning and terminal infrastructure have already reduced the negative impacts of long queues. New dual ramps will further improve traffic flow and ferry berthing.
- The possible positive impacts of the booking system are outweighed by the identified negative impacts, across all types of users. The negative impacts are detailed in Appendix A. Compared to the current queuing system, a booking system would be less efficient; less equitable; impractical to operate; and would impose barriers to visitation that will harm local businesses and the Island's economy.
- The Bruny Island Ferry is a relatively low cost, short duration, high frequency 'commuter' vehicular ferry service. Vehicular ferry services of this type are unsuited to bookings.
- Each resident household and local businesses typically makes hundreds of ferry transits per year. There is no known public transport service that requires users undertaking a 10-15 minute journey to make hundreds of separate pre-paid advance bookings per year. To do so is impractical, inefficient and has high risk of failure.
- There is no evidence that the limited space available at the Kettering terminal will allow for effective separation of 'booked' and 'non-booked' vehicles, without exacerbating traffic management issues on Ferry Rd.
- For these reasons, and the additional issues set out below, Bruny Islanders request the State Government and SeaLink to agree to remove the contractual requirement for SeaLink to implement a booking system on the Bruny Island Ferry, and for the Minister for Transport to facilitate this outcome.

Bruny Island residents, ratepayers, local businesses and community organisations.

## *Statement in relation to proposed Bruny Island Ferry booking system*

6 February 2021

### **Key Points**

#### ***A clear choice:***

- Bruny Islanders, State Government and the ferry operator (SeaLink) share the common aim of choosing the best ticketing and traffic management systems for all classes of ferry users.
- The current choice is between the existing 'queuing system' and a proposed 'booking system'.
- The 'queuing system' involves vehicles being ticketed and loaded in the order in which they arrive at the ferry terminal.
- The 'booking system' involves users booking and pre-paying (mainly online) to secure priority access to a scheduled transit or departure 'window'. Non-booked users would access stand-by places, when available.

#### ***A consensus view:***

- This document has been jointly prepared and unanimously agreed by the Bruny Island representatives on the Bruny Island Ferry Reference Group.
- It is supported by all undersigned Bruny Island community organisations and groups.

#### ***A considered position:***

- The document is presented in three parts: (1) background information on the past two and half years of deliberations; (2) a statement explaining the consensus position of Bruny Islanders and requesting a decision by Government; (3) details about the negative impacts of a booking system identified during community consultations and explored during Reference Group meetings.
- The position adopted by Bruny Islanders is based only on evidence, research and practical experience. It is not influenced by ideology, politics or any external factors. It takes into account the needs of all ferry users.

#### ***In summary:***

- Based on the evidence and information exhaustively considered by the Bruny Island Ferry Reference Group, the best overall system across all types of ferry users is the current queuing system.
- The queuing system is simple, low risk and highly efficient when coupled with sufficient ferry capacity. Recent improvements to traffic management, operational planning and terminal infrastructure have already reduced the negative impacts of long queues. New dual ramps will further improve traffic flow and ferry berthing.
- The possible positive impacts of the booking system are outweighed by the identified negative impacts, across all types of users. The negative impacts are detailed in Appendix A. Compared to the current queuing system, a booking system would be less efficient; less equitable; impractical to operate; and would impose barriers to visitation that will harm local businesses and the Island's economy.
- The Bruny Island Ferry is a relatively low cost, short duration, high frequency 'commuter' vehicular ferry service. Vehicular ferry services of this type are unsuited to bookings.
- Each resident household and local businesses typically makes hundreds of ferry transits per year. There is no known public transport service that requires users undertaking a 10-15 minute journey to make hundreds of separate pre-paid advance bookings per year. To do so is impractical, inefficient and has high risk of failure.
- There is no evidence that the limited space available at the Kettering terminal will allow for effective separation of 'booked' and 'non-booked' vehicles, without exacerbating traffic management issues on Ferry Rd.
- For these reasons, and the additional issues set out below, Bruny Islanders request the State Government and SeaLink to agree to remove the contractual requirement for SeaLink to implement a booking system on the Bruny Island Ferry, and for the Minister for Transport to facilitate this outcome.

## **BACKGROUND**

Approximately two and half years ago, Bruny Islanders became aware that the State Government contract for the Bruny Island Ferry required the new operator, SeaLink, to implement a booking system.

The stated aims for changing from the current queuing system to a booking system were:

- A. On 5-10 days per year, mainly coinciding with public holidays, long queues were extending to the Channel Highway at Kettering, causing traffic disruptions and safety issues.
- B. For 5%-10% of total ferry transits over the year, one or more vehicles were unable to board the scheduled transit due to the ferry being 'full', resulting in wait times of between 30-90 minutes for the next transit. This had downstream impacts on passengers being delayed getting to Bruny Island (including for tourism experiences) or getting to Hobart (including for flights and hire car return).
- C. Nearly all queuing and delay issues were concentrated in a morning peak period from Kettering, an afternoon peak period from Roberts Point, and Friday/pre-long weekend evenings from Kettering.
- D. It is challenging for the ferry operator to make decisions about scheduling additional ferries, including standing-up qualified staff, at short notice.

(A) relates to safety and impacts on non-ferry travellers. (B)-(C) relate to the inconvenience of delays for ferry-travellers. (D) relates to ensuring effective and efficient operations. In theory, a booking system would ameliorate these issues by 'spreading' and pre-determining traffic demand. That is, excessive queuing and unexpected delays would be reduced by travellers having to pre-book and arriving at the ferry terminal in a defined booking departure window. In addition, the ferry operator could use forward bookings as an indicator of the number of staff and vessels required to meet demand.

A related argument cited by Department of State Growth representatives was that other ferry services in Australia, including a number operated by SeaLink, utilise a booking system.

From the outset, significant concerns about the negative impacts of a booking system were held by many Bruny Island residents, ratepayers and business owners. Nonetheless, for two and half years, the community and local business representatives on the Bruny Island Ferry Reference Group have kept an open mind, seeking information and analysis demonstrating how a booking system would achieve the stated aims without negative impacts on core user groups.

Initially, the booking system was to be implemented in October 2018, when SeaLink commenced operations under the new State Government contract. However, it soon became apparent that the terminal infrastructure at both Kettering and Roberts Point was incompatible with the traffic management required to implement a booking system. Since this time, significant infrastructure works have been undertaken, with the latest addition of dual terminal ramps due to be completed in May 2021. The Department of State Growth is of the stated view that current infrastructure works will remove the final impediments to the implementation of a booking system, and SeaLink (in accordance with their contractual obligations to the State Government) are taking actions to implement a system in 2021. Repeated requests by Bruny Island representatives on the Ferry Reference Group for the State Government not to proceed with a booking system, due to the issues raised in this paper, have been politely declined.

Accordingly, all Bruny Island representatives on the Bruny Island Ferry Reference Group believe they now have a responsibility to make a public statement in relation to the booking system, and to seek intervention by the Minister for Infrastructure and Transport.

The views expressed in this statement are based on exhaustive consideration of the issues, including analysis of information on proposed booking systems presented to the Ferry Reference Group, and extensive community consultation.

The statement is endorsed by all the undersigned Bruny Island community organisations.

The community members of the Bruny Island Ferry Reference Group include business owners, permanent residents and shack owners. Collectively, they are members of most Bruny Island community organisations.

## **STATEMENT**

- The identified negative impacts (see Appendix below) of the proposed booking system for the Bruny Island Ferry far outweigh the possible positive impacts. These negative impacts have been documented and discussed across twenty separate Bruny Island Ferry Reference Group meetings, and other forums.
- The negative impacts of a booking system will affect Bruny Islander residents, ratepayers, business owners, service providers, and visitors. There is no evidence that any sector of ferry user, as a whole, will be better off under a booking system than under the current queuing system.
- Each of the stated aims of the booking system can be addressed in other ways, including:
  - a. active traffic management on very busy days
  - b. improved communication to travellers about busy periods
  - c. close communication with tour operators, primary producers and freight providers
  - d. predictive analysis of seasonal, intra-week and intra-day patterns of travel; and
  - e. (above all) flexible ferry capacity to meet variable demand.

These methods have been increasingly used by SeaLink in 2020-21 and have proved successful. The introduction of dual ramps at the ferry terminals in May 2021 will also improve traffic flow, and eliminate vessel berthing delays.
- The Bruny Island ferry service is a relatively low cost, short duration vehicular transit. Currently, during busy periods, three transits occur hourly from each terminal. Resident households and local businesses typically make 2-10 transits per week. It is more similar to the Noosa, Daintree and Wisemans ferry services (none of which have bookings), than higher cost, longer duration ferries with booking systems (such as Kangaroo Island or Stradbroke Island). In other words, the Bruny Island ferry is inherently unsuited to bookings.
- There is no traffic flow analysis presented to the Ferry Reference Group that demonstrates a booking system would achieve any of its stated aims. Indeed, information presented to the Group suggests that given the infrastructure limitations at both terminals, a system requiring separation of booked and non-booked vehicles may exacerbate traffic management issues, especially on Ferry Rd, Kettering.
- With approximately 10,000 ferry transits per year - and variables such as weather, on-Island events, and unscheduled maintenance - it is not possible to eliminate all delays under any system, or any level of viable ferry capacity. While this may be inconvenient at times, it is also an inherent part of travelling via ferry. Nearly all Bruny Islanders, and our visitors, accept that occasional delays are part of 'Island Life'.

Accordingly, there is now a consensus view on Bruny Island that the contractual requirement for SeaLink to implement a booking system should be removed, and instead, less disruptive methods of managing traffic flow should be implemented within the framework of the current queuing system. The community requests the Minister for Infrastructure and Transport to take appropriate actions to implement this change. In addition, the community encourages SeaLink and the State Government to collect, and make public, detailed data on ferry transits, queuing and delays to inform the best methods of maximising traffic flow.

The Bruny Island community has not reached this view because it is opposed to change, or to achieve any ulterior objective. The Bruny Island community has reached this view because every resident, ratepayer and local business has real-life, day-to-day, practical interaction with the ferry service. If there was credible evidence that a booking system would improve the service for all users, it would be supported. It is clear, however, based on all available evidence, that a booking system will result in an inferior service for many users. It is for this reason alone that the community is overwhelmingly opposed to its introduction.

<b>Bruny Island Ferry Reference Group Members</b>	<b>Bruny Island community organisations and groups</b>
Bernice Woolley Siobhan Gaskell Paul Davis Lindon Haigh Mathew Fagan	Bruny Island Community Association Inc (Committee) Bruny Island Tourism Inc Friends of North Bruny Inc Bruny Island Environment Network Inc Country Women's Association (Bruny Island Branch) Bruny Island Boat Club Inc



## **APPENDIX A: IDENTIFIED NEGATIVE IMPACTS OF PROPOSED BRUNY ISLAND FERRY BOOKING SYSTEM**

- Resident, ratepayer and local business travel to and from Bruny Island is frequent, and often unpredictable (particularly when returning from Hobart). All users currently travel with the simplicity and surety that they will board the next available ferry upon arrival, in turn. A booking system would create uncertainty and complexity, with the greatest impact on frequent travellers.
- A booking system will be highly reliant upon a smartphone interface and electronic credit/debit card transactions. Bruny Island has significant cohorts of residents that have limited capacity to use this technology. While telephone bookings are proposed, it does not appear that bookings or changes to bookings via telephone would be available after hours, when many residents are travelling.
- The act of 'booking' entails an additional task prior to every transit. Even if this task takes only 3 minutes per booking, for a typical resident making 200 transits per year this is an additional 10 hours of annual ferry-related transactions – far in excess of offset time savings offered by a booking system.
- The process of validating bookings and placing vehicles into correct lanes will require users to be at the ferry terminal at least 20 minutes prior to departure. Currently, under the queuing system, many travellers safely and efficiently board the ferry arriving closer to the scheduled departure time. The increased time spent waiting under a booking system is inefficient and decreases productivity. It will result in more vehicles having to be managed within the terminal area for longer periods of time, and is incompatible with plans to have smaller, faster ferries departing every 20 minutes.
- To prevent people from 'holding bookings', all bookings will require pre-payment. Where a user misses a scheduled booking (such as due to traffic delays in Hobart) they will either suffer a financial penalty, or have to spend additional time negotiating a credit and/or rescheduling. This will particularly impact users travelling many times per year (residents, ratepayers and local businesses).
- In an effort to address the concerns outlined above, the State Government and SeaLink have proposed to reserve a small number of 'unbooked' places on each ferry transit (20% or 5-10 vehicles). This proposal is flawed in a number of ways, including:
  - it creates unresolved and costly logistical complexities at the point of loading, including the need for both 'booked' and 'unbooked' lanes (extending into Ferry Road at Kettering)
  - it undermines the stated aims of the booking system: if it is not necessary for all users to book, what is to prevent many 'unbooked' users arriving at peak times, creating long queues?
  - it creates two classes of users – those who book will get 'priority' boarding, and those who do not book may, or may not, travel on the next or subsequent transits
  - 'unbooked places' would be available to all users, meaning that at busy times residents, visitors and ratepayers would be 'competing' for these spots
  - considering the points above, it appears to be a 'straw man' proposal: in order to avoid being in the unbooked class of users, most residents, ratepayers and local businesses will have to book, notwithstanding the inferior service experience compared to the current system.
- At present, ferry payment transactions are simple: direct payment via cash or card via a single point-of-sale device operated by SeaLink. In a booking system, the transaction becomes more complicated to complete, as digital information has to be conveyed from the traveller's smartphone to the SeaLink attendant, and mobile coverage at Kettering is sub-optimal. It also remains unclear how concession fares will be processed. These issues pose a risk for *increased delays* compared to the queuing system.
- There is no evidence that visitors choose not to come to Bruny Island because of the current queuing system. Consistent year-on-year increases in visitation to the Island pre-COVID – and the strong Tasmanian-based visitation during COVID – provides compelling evidence to the contrary. In fact, a booking system may be a *barrier* to visitation (as discussed below).
- At present, up to 70% of daily visitors to Bruny make a 'day-trip'. It is not practical or desirable for most of these visitors to avoid peak periods – they choose to arrive at Kettering in the period 8-11 am, and depart Roberts Point 3-6 pm, even if this involves an extended wait time. If, however, visitors have to book a ferry during these peak periods and cannot because it is 'fully booked', many will choose not to come to Bruny Island. Nearly all tourism and hospitality businesses on Bruny (excluding accommodation) rely on day-trippers to remain viable, especially as businesses recover from COVID-19.
- To offset the customer uncertainty created by a booking system, larger tourism operators and service providers will be forced to pre-book multiple places on peak ferry services, up to 12 months in advance, further disadvantaging smaller businesses, independent travellers and Bruny Islanders.
- Most overnight accommodation on Bruny Island is run by small, family operations. Under the current queuing system, all visitors can always get to their accommodation, even if occasionally delayed. If, however, these visitors attempt to book the ferry and find that all suitable ferry transits are 'fully booked', local providers will experience increased booking variations and cancellations.